

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

THE ADVANCED SURGICAL  
INSTITUTE, LLC, a California limited  
liability company, THE ADVANCED  
MEDICAL INSTITUTE, LLC, a  
California limited liability company,

Plaintiffs,

v.

UNITED HEALTHCARE SERVICES,  
INC., a Minnesota corporation dba  
UNITED HEALTHCARE STUDENT  
RESOURCES; SAUDI ARABIAN  
CULTURAL MISSION, a specialized  
agency of the government of Saudi Arabia;  
and DOES 1 through 10, inclusive,

Defendants.

Case No. 8:18-cv-01423-AG (JCx)

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE  
ORDER**

(Superior Court of the State of  
California, County of Orange,  
Case Number: 30-2018-01001487-  
CU-CO-CJC)

Complaint Filed: June 25, 2018

1           **1.     PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS**

2           Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of  
3 confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from  
4 public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation  
5 may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to  
6 enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this  
7 Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery  
8 and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the  
9 limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the  
10 applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section  
11 12.3, below, that this Proposed Protective Order does not entitle them to file  
12 confidential information under seal; Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must  
13 be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from  
14 the court to file material under seal.

15           Based upon the Stipulation of the parties and pursuant to Rule 26(c) of the  
16 Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that:

17           **2.     DEFINITIONS**

18           2.1    Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of  
19 information or items under this Order.

20           2.2    “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how  
21 it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under  
22 Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), including but not limited to patient records and  
23 data, claim files, non-public financial records and data, employee or personnel files,  
24 customer or client lists, confidential contracts, other healthcare-related information  
25 protected by The Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996, and all  
26 other information that the party in good faith believes will, if disclosed, cause harm to  
27 the Producing Party’s competitive position.

1           2.3    “CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY” Information or Items:  
2 subset of information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or  
3 tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c)  
4 subject to limited disclosure as set forth in Paragraph 7.3, that will, if disclosed, cause  
5 substantial competitive and economic harm to the Producing Party. This includes, but  
6 is not limited to, trade secrets, United’s proprietary claims-review and audit processes,  
7 and all other non-public, proprietary financial, regulatory, or strategic information and  
8 data, to the extent that any of these categories of information or tangible things will, if  
9 disclosed, cause substantial competitive and economic harm to the Producing Party.

10           2.4    Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel and House Counsel (as well  
11 as their support staff).

12           2.5    Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or  
13 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL”  
14 or “CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY.”

15           2.5    Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of  
16 the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among  
17 other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are provided, produced or  
18 generated in relation to the claims and disputes in this matter or in disclosures or  
19 responses to discovery in this matter.

20           2.6    Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a  
21 matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to  
22 serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this action.

23           2.7    House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this  
24 action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel or any other  
25 outside counsel.

26           2.8    Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or  
27 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.  
28

1           2.9    Outside Counsel: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this action  
2 but are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and have appeared in this  
3 action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on  
4 behalf of that party or who are providing a party with consultation as to this matter.

5           2.10 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors,  
6 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel (and their support staffs).

7           2.11 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or  
8 Discovery Material in this action.

9           2.12 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support  
10 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or  
11 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and  
12 their employees and subcontractors.

13           2.13 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is  
14 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL” or CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES  
15 ONLY.”

16           2.14 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery  
17 Material from a Producing Party.

18           2.15 United: United Healthcare Services, Inc. and its affiliated companies.

19           **3.   SCOPE**

20           The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected  
21 Material (as defined above), but also any and all copies, excerpts, or compilations of  
22 Protected Material. However, the protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order  
23 do not cover the following information: (a) any information that is in the public domain  
24 at the time of disclosure to a Receiving Party or becomes part of the public domain after  
25 its disclosure to a Receiving Party as a result of publication not involving a violation of  
26 this Order, including becoming part of the public record through trial or otherwise; and  
27 (b) any information known to the Receiving Party prior to the disclosure or obtained by  
28 the Receiving Party after the disclosure from a source who obtained the information

1 lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating Party. Any use of  
2 Protected Material at trial shall be governed by a separate agreement or order.

#### 3 **4. DURATION**

4 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations  
5 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise  
6 in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the  
7 later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this action, with or without prejudice;  
8 and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and exhaustion of all appeals,  
9 rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this action, including the time limits for filing  
10 any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

#### 11 **5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

##### 12 **5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.**

13 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under  
14 this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies  
15 under the appropriate standards.

16 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it  
17 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must  
18 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

##### 19 **5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations.**

20 Except as otherwise provided in this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of  
21 Section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery  
22 Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated  
23 before the material is disclosed or produced. Designation in conformity with this Order  
24 requires:

25 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic  
26 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial  
27 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" or  
28 "CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" to each page that contains

protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

(b) for testimony given in a deposition, confidentiality designations shall be made either on the record or by written notice to the other party within 14 days of receipt of the transcript. Unless otherwise agreed, depositions shall be treated as “Confidential” during the 14-day period following receipt of the transcript. The deposition of any witness (or any portion of such deposition) that encompasses Confidential information shall be taken only in the presence of persons who are qualified to have access to such information.

(c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” or CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY.” If only a portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

### 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate.

If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

## **6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

All challenges to confidentiality designations shall proceed under Local Rule 37-1 through Local Rule 37-4.

///

///

///

1           **7.     ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

2           7.1   Basic Principles.

3           A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or produced by  
4 another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,  
5 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation or related litigation involving some or  
6 all of the parties hereto. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the  
7 categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the  
8 litigation has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of  
9 Section 13 below.

10          Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a  
11 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons  
12 authorized under this Order.

13          7.2   Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items.

14          Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating  
15 Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated  
16 “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

17           (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel in this action, as well as employees of  
18 said Outside Counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for  
19 this litigation;

20           (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the  
21 Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation;

22           (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure  
23 is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment  
24 and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

25           (d) the court and its personnel;

26           (e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock  
27 jurors, licensed private investigators retained by Counsel, and Professional Vendors to  
28

1 whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the  
2 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

3 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is  
4 reasonably necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be  
5 Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the  
6 court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal  
7 Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be  
8 disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order.

9 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a  
10 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

11 7.3 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY”  
12 Information or Items.

13 Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating  
14 Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated  
15 “CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY” only to:

16 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel in this action;

17 (b) United’s House Counsel in this action;

18 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure  
19 is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment  
20 and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

21 (d) the court and its personnel;

22 (e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock  
23 jurors, licensed private investigators retained by Counsel, and Professional Vendors to  
24 whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the  
25 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

26 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is  
27 reasonably necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be  
28 Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the



1 court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal  
2 Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be  
3 disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order.

4 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a  
5 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

6 **8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED**  
7 **PRODUCED**

8 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that  
9 compels disclosure of any information designated by an opposing or third party in this  
10 Action as “CONFIDENTIAL” or “CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY,”  
11 that Party must:

12 (a) unless prohibited by a Court Order, or specifically prohibited by a statute or  
13 regulation cited to the producing party by the requesting party, promptly notify in  
14 writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or  
15 court order, unless prohibited by law;

16 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the request, or subpoena, or  
17 order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the  
18 subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a  
19 copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

20 (c) when applicable, as set forth in ¶ (a), cooperate with respect to all reasonable  
21 procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material  
22 may be affected. However, the parties must follow the procedures set forth in Federal  
23 Rule of Civil Procedure 45(d)(2) when asserting that subpoenaed or requested  
24 information is subject to a privilege. The filing of a motion for a protective order does  
25 not, by itself, stay compliance with a subpoena.

26 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order from a court of  
27 competent jurisdiction, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not  
28 produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a

determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party's permission or as otherwise required by law or court order. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

**9. A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED**

9.1 The terms of this Order are applicable to information, documents and/or tangible things produced by a Non-Party in this action, and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY." Such information produced by Non-Parties, when so designated by the Non-Party upon production or by any other Party pursuant to Section 9.2 below, is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

9.2 In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's confidential information, then the Party shall:

(a) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

(b) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and

(c) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party.

1 If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this Court within  
2 fourteen (14) days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving  
3 Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery  
4 request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not  
5 produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality  
6 agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court order  
7 to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection  
8 in this court of its Protected Material.

9 **10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

10 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed  
11 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this  
12 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing  
13 the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve  
14 all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to  
15 whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d)  
16 request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be  
17 Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

18 **11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR**  
19 **OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL**

20 In accordance with Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B) and Federal Rule  
21 of Evidence 502, any Party who inadvertently produces Discovery Material that is  
22 privileged or otherwise immune from discovery shall, promptly upon discovery of such  
23 inadvertent production, so advise the Producing Party and request that the Discovery  
24 Materials be returned. The Receiving Party shall return, sequester, or destroy such  
25 inadvertently produced Discovery Materials, including all copies, within five (5)  
26 business days of receiving such a written request. The Party returning such  
27 inadvertently produced Discovery Materials may thereafter seek re-production of any  
28 such Discovery Materials pursuant to applicable law.

1           **12. MISCELLANEOUS**

2           12.1 Right to Further Relief.

3           Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by  
4 the court in the future.

5           12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections.

6           By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no Party waives any right it  
7 otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on  
8 any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party  
9 waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material  
10 covered by this Protective Order.

11          12.3 Filing Protected Material.

12          Without written permission from the Designating Party or a court order secured  
13 after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in the public  
14 record in this action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any  
15 Protected Material must comply with Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be  
16 filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific  
17 Protected Material at issue. Pursuant to Local Rule 79-5, a sealing order will issue only  
18 upon a request establishing that the Protected Material at issue is privileged, protectable  
19 as a trade secret, or otherwise entitled to protection under the law. If a Receiving  
20 Party's request to file Protected Material under seal pursuant to Local Rule 79-5 is  
21 denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public  
22 record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

23          **13. FINAL DISPOSITION**

24          Within 60 days after the final disposition of this action, as defined in paragraph 4,  
25 each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or  
26 destroy such material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all  
27 copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or  
28 capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or

1 destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing  
2 Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day  
3 deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material  
4 that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained  
5 any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or  
6 capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are  
7 entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and  
8 hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits,  
9 expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if  
10 such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or  
11 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in  
12 Section 4 (DURATION).

13 IT IS SO ORDERED.

14  
15 Dated: November 19, 2018

14 /s/  
\_\_\_\_\_  
15 Hon. Jacqueline Chooljian  
16 United States Magistrate Judge  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**EXHIBIT A**  
**ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND**

I, \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name], of \_\_\_\_\_  
[print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its  
entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the  
United States District Court for the Central District of California on November 19,  
2018, in the case of *The Advanced Surgical Institute LLC et al. v. United*  
*Healthcare Services, Inc., et al.* Case No. 8:18-cv-01423-AG (JCx).

I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated  
Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could  
expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly  
promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is  
subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict  
compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District  
Court for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms  
of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur  
after termination of this action.

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

City and State where sworn and signed: \_\_\_\_\_

Printed name: \_\_\_\_\_

[printed name]

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_

[signature]